



---

# NEWSLETTER

---

ISSUE NO. 7

OCTOBER 2005

*Editor's Note:* The society is deeply saddened by the passing of our friend and colleague Stanley Sadie. As a tribute we include here the foreword written by Neal Zaslaw to Sadie's last book, *Mozart: The Early Years, 1756-1781*, W. W. Norton & Company, 2006 (available in December wherever hardcover books are sold). We are grateful to the author and publisher for permission to reproduce this in the newsletter.

## Foreword

Neal Zaslaw

It was many years ago that Stanley Sadie revealed to me his desire to write a 'big book' about Mozart's life, times and music. I came to understand that by 'big book' he meant something general as well as something personal—'general' in the sense that no single book has ever managed to occupy the position long held by Otto Jahn's path-breaking four-volume biography of 1856-59, written simultaneously and in conjunction with Ludwig Köchel's similarly path-breaking catalogue of Mozart's works. These two scholars jointly established the historical landscape in which subsequent writing about Mozart would be placed. Jahn's pioneering study was as comprehensive and as reliable in its details as the then-current state of knowledge about Mozart permitted. Jahn created a sympathetic, coherent portrait of a cultural hero for German lands, a portrait that satisfied many generations of music lovers. His vision is with us still—in sublimated form—in thousands of program notes, recording notes, popular essays and books.

Jahn's work was revised several times before Hermann Abert thoroughly reworked it in 1919-21, taking advantage of seventy additional years of research and adjusting Jahn's tone and opinions to post-World War I European sensibilities. Subsequently, Abert's version of Jahn itself went through revisions. The flood of Central European performers, critics and musicologists fleeing Nazism to Great Britain, North America, Australia and New Zealand in the 1930s and 40s ensured that the Jahn-Abert image of Mozart was transplanted to the musical and academic cultures of the English-speaking world.

The absence of a replacement for Jahn has not been for lack of trying. Books about Mozart number in the hundreds. Yet even though a few of them are outstanding contributions, no author has succeeded in creating a Mozart for our times in quite the way that Jahn created the Mozart for his times and Abert for his. The person who came closest for the Anglophone world was Alfred Einstein, one of those who fled to the United States in the 1930s. In his books, articles, and revisions of Köchel's Catalogue, Einstein dominated post-World War II thinking about Mozart. He modified but did not replace Jahn-Abert.

For a number of reasons, no one has been able to occupy the position once held by Jahn. Certainly, the world of high culture is a more fractured, fractious place than it once was, and we are less inclined to accept spurious 'official' or totalizing views of the world. The daunting amount of historical material now available to document Mozart's life, works and times, combined, paradoxically, with the certainty that no amount of evidence could suffice to answer all questions, leaves open endless possibilities for more or less convincing interpretations. Recent valuable biographies in English have been produced by Maynard Solomon, Ruth Halliwell, and Stanley Sadie himself (see below).

The failure of most authors to alter the obsolete aspects of the Jahn-Abert-Einstein take on Mozart is due at least in part to their political or cultural aspirations (not that Jahn, Abert or Einstein lacked such aspirations!). Mozart's music, his prestige and his persona have been, and continue to be, contested cultural property. Many biographies, especially but not exclusively popular books of *haute vulgarisation*, made him a supernatural phenomenon—more god than man—a brilliant meteor that flashed across the skies of the dying *ancien régime* and burnt out in a blaze of glory. Polyanna-ish good-old-days biographies made him a kind of royalist. Biographies from Germany and Austria during the Nazi era represented him a Germanic nationalist, whereas

books from other countries needed to see him as a cosmopolitan lover of mankind in general, the best of Germanic culture before it took a grievously wrong turn. Biographies from Eastern Europe (and occasionally elsewhere) wanted to see Mozart as a people's



*continued on page 12*

## From the Editor

The SECM newsletter is published twice yearly, in October and April, and includes items of interest to its membership. Submissions in the following categories are encouraged:

- news of recent accomplishments from members of the society (publications, presentations, awards, performances, promotions, etc.)
- reviews of performances of eighteenth-century music
- reviews of books, editions, or recordings of eighteenth-century music
- conference reports
- dissertations in progress on eighteenth-century music
- upcoming conferences and meetings
- calls for papers and manuscripts
- research resources
- grant opportunities

Contributions should be submitted as an attachment to an e-mail (preferably in Microsoft Word) to Margaret Butler, SECM newsletter editor, at [mbutler@music.ua.edu](mailto:mbutler@music.ua.edu). Submissions must be received by July 1 for the October issue and by January 1 for the April issue. Claims for missing issues of the newsletter must be requested within six months of publication. Annotated discographies (in format given in inaugural issue, October 2002) will also be accepted and will be posted on the SECM Web site. Discographies should be sent to [smurray@wcupa.edu](mailto:smurray@wcupa.edu).



### SECM Officers

Sterling Murray, President; Bertil van Boer, Vice-President; Mara Parker, Secretary-Treasurer

### SECM Board of Directors

Margaret Butler, Dexter Edge, Emily Green, Mark Knoll, Steven Zohn

### SECM Honorary Members

Eugene K. Wolf (2002), Daniel Hertz (2003), H. C. Robbins Landon (2004)



### New Members

The society extends a warm welcome to its newest members: Marvin Cutler, Don Fader, Stefano Mengozzi, Judith Ortega Rodriguez, William Dean Sutcliffe, Robert Torre, and Beverly Wilcox.



### Acknowledgments

The Society wishes to thank Robert T. Stroker, Dean, Boyer College of Music and Dance of Temple University, and Timothy Blair, Dean, College of Visual and Performing Arts, School of Music, West Chester University, West Chester, Pennsylvania for their generous financial support of the SECM newsletter.

## Message from the President

*Sterling E. Murray*

It is difficult to believe that it has been only four years since the Society for Eighteenth-Century Music was founded. As I look back over these years, it is with a great sense of pleasure and satisfaction that I note how much we have achieved and how far we have come in this short time. This year also marks the end of my second term as your president. It seems appropriate that I take this opportunity to share with you my view of some of the accomplishments of our society in its infant years.

First let me assure you that SECM is secure and flourishing. Response to our society has been enthusiastic. The thirty names of our first membership list have now grown to over one hundred, including performers, conductors, teachers, and scholars from several countries. Early on the society made the decision to consider the entire eighteenth century, without imposing any stylistic or geographical limitations. As a result, our organization has been greatly enriched by a membership whose research interests span a wide and diverse spectrum within the eighteenth-century arena.

Beginning with an inaugural issue of October 2002, the SECM newsletter has served our membership as a primary vehicle for communication and the dissemination of information. Thanks to the exceptional efforts and tireless work of our newsletter editor, Margaret Butler, and our Web master, Mark Knoll, the society's newsletter has established and maintained a level of excellence that could easily serve as a model for other professional societies. In addition to news about and tributes to our members, reports on conferences, festivals, musical performances, and new publications, the newsletter also features articles on topics of special interest to our readers.

As a second means of communication among and beyond our membership, a Web site was established at [www.secm.org](http://www.secm.org). The society is indebted to Mark Knoll for the creation and maintenance of this excellent resource. Easily accessed through our Web site are a forum for the exchange of information, the text of the society's newsletters, and valuable links to other sites of composers, professional societies, libraries/collections, publishers, performing ensembles, recording companies, journals, prominent personages, and special conferences.

SECM is in the process of providing two new resources for our members on the society's Web site. The first is a series of discographies of works by eighteenth-century composers, compiled by the membership for their use in teaching and research. Already available is a discography of the music of the Bohemian composer, Antonio Rosetti (ca. 1750–1792), submitted by Diether Steppuhn, secretary of the International Rosetti Society. We invite other members to contribute discographies of their own. If you have a discography that you would like to be considered, please send it to me at [smurray@wcupa.edu](mailto:smurray@wcupa.edu). All lists should conform to the format established in the society's newsletter of October 2002 (see issue available on our Web site).

The second major resource is still in progress. This will involve a transcription of Charles Burney's travel diaries, beginning with the volume devoted to his travels in France and Italy. Mark Knoll has dealt with the technical issues surrounding this project, and the first chapter has been imported into the database. It is anticipated that the complete text will be available on the Web site in the very near future.

Since its inception SECM has enjoyed a close association with the Mozart Society of America (MSA) and the American Society for Eighteenth-Century Studies (ASECS). We recently formed an alliance with yet another professional society with similar interests—the British Society for Eighteenth-Century Studies. BSECS meets each January at St. Hugh's College, Oxford, and publishes the *British Journal of Eighteenth-Century Studies*. Frank Gorman, president of BSECS, has extended to our society an open invitation to attend and present papers at its meetings and to submit articles for consideration to its journal.

For the past four years, SECM has sponsored sessions at the annual meeting of the American Musicological Society. The format for these gatherings, established at the first session in Houston, Texas, has continued each year since. In addition to a short business meeting involving the presentation awards, these sessions have featured a guest speaker and a musical performance. Our past speakers have been James Webster (Cornell University), Christoph Wolff (Harvard University), and Daniel Hertz (Professor Emeritus, University of California, Berkeley). This year in Washington D.C. Julian Rushton (Professor Emeritus, University of Leeds) will address the society on the topic "What Does this Remind Me of? Plagiarism or Shareware in Eighteenth-Century Music." Please check our Web site for the date and time of Professor Rushton's presentation as well as an abstract of his text. A special feature of our sessions at the AMS has been the live performance of music. This year we will be entertained by the Liric String Quartet of Bucharest, Romania in performances of string quartets by Ignaz Pleyel and Antonio Rosetti.

Each year, the Society for Eighteenth-Century Music has recognized the achievements of a scholar or performer working in the field of eighteenth-century musical studies by awarding that individual an honorary plaque and a life-time membership in the society. Past recipients of this honor have been Eugene K. Wolf (2002), Daniel Hertz (2003), and H. C. Robbins Landon (2004). This year the society will again present this award during our session at the AMS in Washington, D.C.

In the spring of 2004, SECM sponsored its inaugural conference at Georgetown University. In addition to formal papers, there were two project report sessions and musical performances by fortepianist Maria Rose and a chamber ensemble including Jeanne Fischer, Mary Oleskiewicz, Steve Zohn, and David Schulenberg. Thanks in part to the excellent planning and execution by the program committee (chaired by Michael Ruhling) and local arrangements coordinator, Anthony DelDonna, the Georgetown conference was an enormous success. Seven papers from this meeting will be published in a conference report, *Music in 18<sup>th</sup>-Century Life: Cities, Courts, Churches: Selected Papers from the Inaugural Conference of the Society for Eighteenth-Century Music, 30 April–2 May 2004* by Steglein Publishing, Ann Arbor, MI. This collection of essays, edited by Mara Parker, is scheduled for release in early 2006.

The second biennial conference of SECM will be held 21–23 April 2006 in Williamsburg, Virginia. The theme of this meeting is "Genre in Eighteenth-Century Music." The program committee (Paul Corneilson, chair, Jane Hettrick, Dorothea Link, Philip Olleson, and Michael Ruhling) has put together an informative and stimulating program of papers, project reports, and musical performances. A highlight of this program will be an evening recital by Malcolm Bilson on a restored historic piano. Complementing Professor Bilson's recital will be a tour of the restoration facility

of Colonial Williamsburg given by John Watson, Conservator of Instruments and Mechanical Arts for Colonial Williamsburg.

The College of William and Mary is our local host for this conference. The society wishes to express its gratitude to Katherine Preston, chair of the music department, and Jamie Armstrong, who is serving as liaison between the college and the society. The local arrangements committee (Steve Zohn, chair, Gloria Eive, Michael Ruhling, and Jen-yen Chen) has worked diligently to see to it that all will run smoothly and efficiently for our upcoming visit to Williamsburg. One could not hope for a more appropriate and appealing venue for our meeting than Colonial Williamsburg. The conference will be housed at the Woodlands, a conference center owned and operated by Colonial Williamsburg. Participants who stay at the conference hotel will be given a special reduction on admission tickets to tour the historic houses and shops in the restored area, where one can also enjoy the town from a horse-drawn carriage or dine in the authentic atmosphere of an eighteenth-century tavern. Please plan to take full advantage of this special opportunity by coming early or staying after the meeting to tour the recreated atmosphere of this mid-eighteenth-century town. Bring your family and make it a mini-vacation. More information on Colonial Williamsburg is available at [www.history.org](http://www.history.org). Please check the society's Web site for registration and program details as they become available.

Plans for the conference in 2008 to be held in London, England are underway. The society welcomes the active involvement of all members. If you would like to serve on a committee or become more involved in the work of the society in some other manner, please be in contact with me at [smurray@wcupa.edu](mailto:smurray@wcupa.edu). The society's board of directors is intent on our organization responding to the needs and wishes of its membership. If you would like to propose a project for the society or if you have ideas on how our work could be accomplished in a more receptive manner, please let us know.

Thank you for your confidence in electing me as your president for two terms. I have enjoyed my tenure and the opportunity it has provided to make my small contribution to the efforts of this exceptional organization. I look forward to seeing you at the AMS meeting next month in Washington D.C. and again at our conference in Williamsburg in April 2006.



## Conferences & Concert Announcements

"Interpretare Mozart," international conference sponsored by the Società italiana di musicologia and the Arcadia Foundation, 19–21 May 2006, Milan. Deadline: 30 January 2006. For more information see [www.secm.org](http://www.secm.org).

The second biennial conference of the Society for Eighteenth-Century Music will be held 21–23 April 2006 in Williamsburg, Virginia. The theme for the meeting is "Genre in Eighteenth-Century Music." For more information see [www.secm.org](http://www.secm.org).

The Mozart Society of America's third biennial conference, "Mozart's Choral Music: Composition, Contexts, Performance," will be held at Indiana University, 10–12 February 2006. Highlights of the conference include a performance of Robert Levin's new completion of the C-Minor Mass and a performance of the Requiem on period instruments. Sessions are organized around

*continued on page 12*

## Members' News

**Margaret Butler** was awarded a grant from the University of Alabama's Research Advisory Committee to conduct research in Parma in the summer of 2005.

**Ilias Chrissochoidis** is the recipient of an ASECS/Mellon Postdoctoral Fellowship at the Harry Ransom Humanities Research Center, UT-Austin, and of the Kanner Fellowship in British Studies at the Center for Seventeenth- and Eighteenth-Century Studies, UCLA. He has also made the following presentations: The American Handel Society Conference, Santa Fe, NM, 17-20 March 2005, "Born in the Press: The Public Molding of Handel's Esther into an English Oratorio"; the 36th Annual Meeting of the American Society for Eighteenth-Century Studies, Las Vegas, 31 March - 3 April 2005: "Quantifying Genius: British Adaptations of de Piles' Scale of Painters"; the annual joint meeting of the Pacific Southwest and Northern California AMS chapters, University of Southern California, Los Angeles, 30 April - 1 May 2005: "Sid Caesar, 'Argument to Beethoven's Fifth': A Comic Misreading of Cultural Consequence."

**Jason Grant** has accepted a position as visiting assistant professor in the department of music at the University of Pittsburgh.

**Dale Higbee**, music director of Carolina Baroque, announces the release of the group's two newest CDs, "Sacred Music by Bach and Concertos by Bach & Telemann," CB 120 (recorded live 3/11/05) and "German Genius: Bach & Handel," CB 121 (recorded live 5/13/05), available from Carolina Baroque: [www.carolinabaroque.org](http://www.carolinabaroque.org).

**Sterling Murray** has been awarded a fellowship from Colonial Williamsburg and the John D. Rockefeller, Jr. Library for the summer of 2006 to conduct research on Thomas Arne's pasticcio, *Love in a Village*.

**Philip Olleson's** book *Musical Life in Late Eighteenth-Century England: The Letter-Journals of Susan Burney* has been accepted for publication by Ashgate Publishers.

**John Rice** will be a guest lecturer in musicology at the University of Alabama during the fall of 2005 as part of the university's endowed chair in music program.

**Robert L. Weaver's** paper "I dilettanti: fondamento di una cultura musicale" has been accepted for the meeting of the Società italiana di musicologia in Pesaro, October 20-23, 2005. The subject is an expansion of his two recent articles on the musical activities of the Ricasoli family and the history of the Ricasoli Collection: "The Ricasoli Firidolfi: Musicians and Patrons of Music in Eighteenth- and Early Nineteenth-Century Florence," in *Music Observed: Studies In Memory Of William C. Holmes*, eds. Colleen Reardon and Susan Parisi (Warren, MI: Harmonie Park Press, 2004), pp. 512-533, and "The Keyboard Concerto in Tuscany in the Late Eighteenth Century," in *Concertos For Keyboards*, Volume 1, Monuments of Tuscan Music Series I: Orchestral Music, gen. ed., Robert L. Weaver, pp. viii-xi.

**Laurel Zeiss** co-authored (with Michele Henry) "Musicians as Authors: Teaching the Art of Writing Program Notes," *College Music Symposium*, vol. 44 (2004). Her review of *The Cambridge Companion to Mozart*, edited by Simon P. Keefe, appears in *Notes: The Quarterly Journal of the Music Library Association* 61 (2004): 122-124. She presented a paper titled "The Pros and Cons of Teaching Don Giovanni" at the College Music Society Annual Meeting in San Francisco in November 2004. In May 2005 she traveled to Kenya with the Baylor University Men's Choir.

## Lenore Coral (1939-2005) A Tribute by Former Students

*Francesca Brittan, Emily Dolan, and Nancy November*

Lenore Coral passed away in Ithaca NY, on 10 March of this year. She was an extraordinary music librarian, with a keen interest in all matters pertaining to the "long" eighteenth century—not to mention before and beyond. Following her Ph.D. dissertation, "Music in English Auction Sales, 1676-1750" (University of London, 1974), she co-authored *British Book Sale Catalogues 1676-1800: A Union List* (with A. N. L. Munby, 1977). At the time of her passing she was considerably advanced in the compilation of entries for a sequel. One of her former students, Nicholas Willie, is currently working towards the completion of this substantial project, the provisional title of which is *Bibliography of British Book Auction Catalogues: 1801-1900* and whose records will number over 17,000.

Lenore's enthusiasm for eighteenth-century studies was infectious. A special interest of hers was the English amateur musician and collector Granville Sharp, on whom she wrote for *New Grove II*. We can well remember a lively discussion following her presentation of a paper on the Sharps, during Cornell's Monday evening music colloquium series. The debate focused on Johan Zoffany's representation of the Sharps' practice of music-making on barges on the Thames: what, exactly could we learn from such a depiction? She keenly promoted such speculations on eighteenth-century musical subjects, while establishing herself as a music librarian of international repute and great breadth of knowledge. Lenore served as President of the Music Library Association and as a Vice-President of the International Association of Music Libraries, Archives and Documentation Centres. She was also an active member of the American Musicological Society at the national and chapter levels.

To remember Lenore is to remember not only a librarian and scholar, but a friend, confidant, co-conspirator, chum, helpmeet, great cook, and famous stickler for the rules. We got to know Lenore, as all first-year Cornell Ph.D. students do, in her course titled "Bibliographical Methods"—a class that, despite all the odds, turned out to be the most hilarious we would take in the following several years. Throughout that semester we often complained that the seminar room was too cold (the building had just been remodeled and the heating system had not been perfected). To compensate for our chilly seminars, Lenore invited the entire class to her cozy house for a salmon dinner complete with a fire crackling in the fireplace. This was the kind of hospitality we grew to expect from Lenore.

Lenore had a famous sense of humor, and a house full of interesting books and oddities. She could tell a story about anything, and regaled us with memories of her student days in London, funny experiences at conferences, and personal recollections of well-known scholars. Even in the final weeks, she still chatted and told jokes, and asked us how our work was coming. In early May, we had the bittersweet experience of organizing a sale of Lenore's extensive personal collection of books and scores. At her request, they were sold inexpensively to Cornell graduate students—a fitting final gift from a librarian of extraordinary generosity and talent. It's comforting to know that we each have a few of her books on our own shelves. Lenore is fondly remembered and will be greatly missed by students and scholars of the eighteenth century.

## New Edition of Haydn's Scottish and Welsh Songs

Marjorie E. Rycroft

It was in November 1799 that George Thomson, Edinburgh publisher and amateur musician, first wrote to Joseph Haydn inviting him to compose 'Symphonies and Accompaniments' for some of the finest Scottish airs of the day. Haydn accepted the commission, and between 1800 and 1804 provided over 200 songs, arranged for voice(s), violin, cello and piano, for Thomson's *Select Collections of Original Scottish, Welsh and Irish Airs*. These songs are now available in two handsome volumes edited by Marjorie Rycroft in association with Warwick Edwards and Kirsteen McCue (all from University of Glasgow) and published in the collected edition of *Joseph Haydn Werke*. The first volume, devoted to Haydn's Scottish songs of 1800–1802 ('Volkliedbearbeitungen Nr. 151–268 Schottische Lieder für George Thomson', *JHW XXXII*, vol. 3, 2001, G.Henle Verlag, München) appeared in 2002.

Publication of the second volume ('Volkliedbearbeitungen Nr. 269–364 Schottische und walisische Lieder für George Thomson', *JHW XXXII*, vol. 4, 2005, G.Henle Verlag, München) was marked with a press launch on 13 May 2005 at Vienna's Musikverein and a concert the following day attended by an audience of over 600 in the Haydnsaal of the Esterházy Palace, Eisenstadt. Edited from original manuscript sources, this volume of 96 Scottish and Welsh songs, 29 of which were never published by Thomson, provides performers for the first time with complete texts and instrumental parts for all the songs and revisions that Haydn sent to Thomson in 1803–1804. Although Haydn put his name to all of these songs, a significant number are the work, either wholly or in part, of Haydn's pupil, Sigismund Neukomm. In addition to the 23 Neukomm songs discovered by Rudolph Angermüller in Paris, Marjorie Rycroft has been able to identify a further 13 that are almost certainly by him and several more which have sufficient Neukomm characteristics as to cast doubt on their authorship. In addition to a comprehensive critical commentary, the volume contains extensive excerpts from Thomson's correspondence not only with Haydn but also with poets he commissioned to write new verses, among them Anne Hunter and Amelia Opie.



Warwick Edwards (University of Glasgow), Armin Raab (Director, Joseph Haydn-Institut), Marjorie Rycroft (University of Glasgow), Kirsteen McCue (University of Glasgow) and Andreas Friesenhagen (Joseph Haydn-Institut) pictured in the Musikverein, Vienna, at the launch of the *Urtext* edition of Haydn's Scottish and Welsh songs.

Using these *Urtext* editions, and with the assistance of Marjorie Rycroft as consultant musicologist, the Austrian ensemble, Haydn Trio Eisenstadt, together with Scottish singers, Lorna Anderson and Jamie MacDougall, have embarked on a long-term concert and recording project. This is aimed at producing a series of 18 CDs on the Brilliant Classics label, comprising Haydn's entire output of folksongs for George Thomson and two other Scottish publishers, William Napier and William Whyte. Many of the Scottish songs have original texts written by Robert Burns. It is therefore fitting that completion of the recording project will coincide with the bicentenary of Haydn's death and the 250th anniversary of Robert Burns's birth in 2009.

The project has already caused a considerable stir in Austria and in the UK. The first CD in the series (Brilliant Classics 92278) was launched in May 2004 at a concert in the Haydnsaal of the Esterházy Palace, Eisenstadt, where so much of Haydn's music was composed and performed during his lifetime. May 2005 saw the release of vol. 2 in the series, a 4-CD boxed set (Brilliant Classics 92542).



## New Edition from Musica Toscana

Robert Weaver

Musica Toscana, Inc., has issued the third volume in its Monuments of Tuscan Music, Series I: Orchestral Music: Concertos For Keyboards, Volume I. The volume contains three keyboard concertos: Concerto in D with obbligato solo violin by Carl Antonio Champion; Concerto in F by Andrea Lucchesi; and Concerto in F by Johann Wanhal. The Champion and the Lucchesi are editions by Scott Roberts and Anna Kasket respectively from unique manuscripts. The first was possibly composed for Giulia Acciajoli Ricasoli with the violin obbligato part intended for the composer. The introduction to the second concerto is provided by Giorgio Taboga, presenting for the first time in English recent Italian research on the subject of the Italian contribution to the creation of the Classical style. The concerto by Wanhal, also edited by Kasket, is known from an earlier edition of a manuscript that lacks the wind instruments; the MTI publication is thus the first of the complete concerto. For more information please contact: [musicatoscanainc@earthlink.net](mailto:musicatoscanainc@earthlink.net).



## Music Review

Laurel E. Zeiss

Dorothea Link, ed. *Arias for Nancy Storace: Mozart's First Suzzanna*. Recent Researches in the Music of the Classical Era 66. Middleton, Wisconsin: A-R Editions, 2002, and Dorothea Link, ed. *Arias for Francesco Benucci: Mozart's First Figaro and Guglielmo*. Recent Researches in the Music of the Classical Era 72. Middleton, Wisconsin: A-R Editions, 2004.

Nancy Storace and Francesco Benucci were two of the most admired singing-actors of the 1780s. Musicologist Dorothea Link has compiled vocal scores of arias composed expressly for or closely associated with these two artists. Taken from eighteenth-century sources and aimed at both scholars and performers, these editions

demonstrate how arias were often tailored to a specific singer's strengths and tastes. They also allow "today's singers to experience the kind of arrangements that eighteenth-century performers and opera lovers played and sang" (Benucci, vii). Link's attempt to make this repertoire available to scholars and singers is admirable, but some improvements could render these editions more usable by performers.

Both volumes commence with introductions that summarize Storace's and Benucci's careers and the types of arias they frequently performed. While Benucci specialized in comic roles, Storace started her career singing serious roles, but gradually shifted to lighter ones. Link ascribes this change to the singer's participation in Salieri's *La grotto di Trofonio*, a work which required her to transform from a serious-minded to a light-hearted young woman. The account of Storace's career reminds us that these operas were performed by younger, lighter voices than they are now, perhaps at the singer's peril. Storace was only twenty-one when she premiered *Susanna* (the first Don Giovanni, Luigi Bassi, was also only twenty-one); by the end of the 1780s, however, a number of reviews comment on the "roughness" of her voice (ix).

The introductions also elucidate the editor's selection criteria, which differ slightly for each volume. Both collections use eighteenth-century vocal scores as primary sources, but include only arias for which orchestral scores are available in modern editions or reprints so that the selections "can potentially find their way into the concert repertoire" (Storace, vii). The Storace volume focuses on "favorite airs" published for domestic performance. Most of these are lyrical cavatinas, but Link wisely includes other significant numbers as well, including "Care donne che bramate" by Nancy's brother Stephen Storace, which became the subject of a landmark copyright suit, and the Scottish air with German contrafactum that she sang at her farewell concert in Vienna. The volume also includes a bravura aria from *Giulio Sabino* to reflect the soprano's renowned ability to imitate the castrato Marchesi. In contrast to Storace, few of Benucci's arias were sold in commercial arrangements which, as the editor notes, were primarily geared toward women. Therefore the Benucci edition presents selections from popular operas that in Link's opinion "constituted Benucci's best" (ix). For these excerpts, she relies more on vocal scores of complete operas. The prefaces of both volumes conclude with a detailed table of the singers' roles.

Helpful texts, translations and plot synopses precede the musical excerpts. The music itself is well laid out and easy to read. Critical reports at the end of each volume, in conjunction with the introductions, give good information about the sources used, particularly the different types of scores that exist for Viennese works, and the difficulty of establishing accurate cast lists for Viennese productions.

As stated above, Link compiled these arrangements from eighteenth-century vocal scores; if multiple arrangements exist she used the earliest as her primary source. Although this editorial method is consistent and does provide insight into the era's domestic music-making, it creates some hindrances to performers. As Link admits, the keyboard parts are "thin" and not very idiomatic; inconsistent textures and voice leading make some passages very awkward to play (Storace, 11-112; Benucci, 113). This is more true for the Storace volume, partly due to more figuration in the original orchestral accompaniments; in addition some of the Storace excerpts are adapted from keyboard reductions embedded

in orchestral scores, which probably were intended as continuo parts rather than stand alone accompaniments. A skilled, confident pianist could make adjustments, but Link could give more advice about how to do so, beyond suggesting "today's accompanist using a piano may wish to double the bass notes in octaves and to thicken chords where appropriate" (Benucci, 113). Many passages contain repeated eighth notes in the bass, for example, which on the harpsichord and the pianoforte help sustain the harmony. On a modern piano, the extensive repeated notes are unnecessary; a performer would want to eliminate some repetitions. The piano also frequently doubles the vocal line at the unison or the octave. To avoid ensemble problems, particularly in rapid passages and during recitatives, an accompanist would want to play chords on the strong beats instead. In cases where more than one keyboard reduction exists, choosing the more keyboard friendly of the two might have been a better editorial method. Another option would have been to include some suggested realizations in small notes or short samples of how a modern performer might modify the accompaniments for public performance.

Several other additions or deletions would make these volumes more appealing to performers. The plot synopses in the text and translation sections, for example, do an excellent job of establishing each aria's dramatic context. However, the headings in this section only include the aria titles; reiterating the title of the opera and the composer would help those unfamiliar with these works connect information from the introduction to the musical excerpts. Another concern has to do with the excerpts themselves. If one of the goals is for the arias "to find their way into the concert repertoire" (Storace, vii), they need to be viable in the concert hall. Benucci's two arias from *La grotto di Trofonio*, for instance, pose obstacles to performance. "Spirti invisibili" incorporates chorus; "Questo magico abituro" lacks a clear ending. Including "Deh vieni" in the Storace volume is interesting from a scholarly point of view, but the edition might have been better served by another aria in English from Storace's London repertoire or the wildly popular *Una cosa rara*.

Despite these criticisms, several numbers could be used as recital excerpts. The two arias for Storace from *La grotto di Trofonio*, "D'un dolce amor la face" and "La ra la ra, che filosofo buffon," are musically compelling; the former would allow a soprano to showcase large register shifts in a less demanding number than "Come scoglio." Likewise, "Lei comandi, signorina" and "Per onor farsi ammazzare" in the Benucci volume would allow young baritones to perfect their buffa technique before tackling Guglielmo or Leporello. These editions also provide scholar-teachers another tool to draw on in order to situate Mozart's music in its wider context. In addition to providing examples of conventional aria types to study or perform in class, they also include a number of passages that sound very Mozartian in character that could be used to demonstrate the ubiquity of certain melodic and harmonic conventions (e.g., "Ahimè! Dove m'inoltro. . . Non potrò del caro bene" mm. 96-118, "Che novità. . . Come lasciar potrei" mm. 47-70.).

For this reviewer, these editions raise several issues that warrant further consideration. In the introduction to the Benucci volume, Link remarks that the vocal lines in Paisiello's arias for Benucci are more conventional in nature. She then wonders if "perhaps composers with international careers wrote more to formula than court composers like Salieri, who was more responsive to the circumstances of a specific commission and to singers with whom he

worked on a more or less daily basis for years” (Benucci, ix). Her claim seems logical and deserves more study. Link’s statement that “probably only first-rank singers had their arias tailored to their voices” and that “far more arias were written for voice types than we tend to assume” seems more questionable. Haydn, for example, worked with somewhat weaker singers and revised numerous arias to fit their limitations. I would like to suggest that, particularly given the conventional nature of eighteenth-century opera, the answer is not either/or (customized arias vs. generic voice types), but rather both. An artist the caliber of Benucci would fall within a standard vocal profile yet still have arias tailored to his specific strengths; lesser singers might have arias doctored to cover weaknesses or their roles enhanced, as Mozart did with Arbace in *Idomeneo*.

Another intriguing question is why many of the “favorite airs” in the Storace volume (six of fifteen) are not merely arias but include the preceding recitatives. The inclusion of the recitatives implies that recitative monologues and the subsequent arias were considered a unit, either by publishers or audiences or both. It also suggests that performers at home were recreating entire scenes, not just the “hit tunes.” How widespread this practice was and its implications merit further investigation, as does what selections from operas were published and the role singers played in the marketing of excerpts. As Link points out, Storace’s name and engravings of her were used to advertise sheet music (x-xii).

*Arias for Nancy Storace: Mozart’s First Susanna and Arias for Francesco Benucci: Mozart’s First Figaro and Guglielmo* shed light on the interaction between singers, composers, and domestic music-makers and complement other studies on how singers influenced repertoire. Hopefully, more scores like these will make opera excerpts by Mozart’s contemporaries readily available to present-day performers and scholars.



## New Books

*From Garrick to Gluck: Essays on Opera in the Age of Enlightenment* (Hillsdale, NY: Pendragon Press, 2004) is a collection of eighteen essays written by Daniel Heartz between 1967 and 2001. Edited by John A. Rice, the book covers a wide variety of operatic genres and topics: opera buffa (in particular the work of Goldoni and Galuppi); opera seria (especially as cultivated by the librettist Metastasio, the singer Farinelli, and the composers Galuppi and Hasse); opéra-comique; the *Querelle des Bouffons*; and the reform operas of Traetta and Gluck.

*Organ Restoration Reconsidered: Proceedings of a Colloquium* (Warren, MI: Harmonie Park Press, 2005), edited by John R. Watson, has recently been published in association with the Colonial Williamsburg Foundation, Williamsburg, Virginia. The volume includes essays by the editor, Laurence Libin, Robert L. Barclay, Darryl Martin, David Blanchfield, David Goist, Barbara Owen, Christopher Kent, Dominic Gwynn, George Taylor with Bruce Shull, Raymond J. Brunner, Göran Grahn, and Darcy Kuronen. It brings together a series of essays delivered at the international colloquium “Historic Organs Reconsidered: Restoration and Conservation for a New Century,” held in 1999 at Historic St. Luke’s Church in Smithfield, Virginia.

Part 1 of the book places the often-vexing issues of organ restoration in the broader context of musical instrument restoration and historic preservation, and considers the implications of emerg-

ing “forensic” examination methods for restoration ethics. Part 2 visits two conservation laboratories, providing an inside glimpse of new approaches to preservation-minded restoration. Part 3 focuses specifically on the Historic St. Luke’s organ and its musical history, with attention to the organ’s possible builder, its first owners, and early repertory. Part 4 offers perspectives on restoration through case studies of other historic organs in Europe and America. For more information, contact Harmonie Park Press at [www.HarmonieParkPress.com](http://www.HarmonieParkPress.com).



## Book Reviews

Giancarlo Rostirolla, *Il “Mondo novo” musicale di Pier Leone Ghezzi* (Milan: Skira, 2001).

Sarah Bruce Kelly



This fascinating and important study brings together in a single volume the 384 “musical” sketches of the famous eighteenth-century caricaturist Pier Leone Ghezzi (1674–1755). The book includes not only the drawings and caricatures archived at the Roman library, but also those that ended up in the collections of many museums and libraries around the world. The drawings are supplemented by a rich catalog of biographical/bibliographical information about the individuals represented, which, along with enlightening essays by Rostirolla, Anna Lo Bianco, and Stefano La Via, represents a patient and rigorous project that has added tremendously to the previous work of Petrobelli, Cametti, and others. The works in this collection are a visual document of early eighteenth-century musical culture, and the detail depicted will be of great interest to music historians, especially students of *settecento* opera.

Through his spontaneous and often exaggerated depictions, Ghezzi codified a lively and theatrical artistic style that captured the essence of his subjects’ personalities with astonishing precision. Born into a family of artists that had long enjoyed papal and aristocratic patronage, Ghezzi was a noted painter in his own right. By the late 1720s, however, his commissions for decorative frescoes, history paintings, and formal portraits had become overshadowed by his reputation as a caricature artist. Moreover, he was a skilled musician, and his practical knowledge of and passion for music and singing is evident in the intricate and revealing nuances of his many musical-related sketches. His talent lay in his ability to capture the essential features of a person with a few quick strokes of the pen, and his works are distinguished by their freshness and naturalism.

Beginning in the early 1720s Ghezzi opened his home regularly to friends with musical interests, to listen to good music and participate in amateur performances. During these gatherings, which brought together the elite musical and scholarly society of Rome as well as numerous foreign visitors, he produced a picture-gallery of composers, singers, instrumentalists, comedians, impresarios, and patrons. These hundreds of vividly expressive drawings depict not only amateur musicians but a host of musical celebrities who visited Rome to work in the theaters or for private patrons. Over the years, his guests included such celebrated theatrical composers as Vivaldi, Jommelli, and Pergolesi. Ghezzi also sketched many of the singers he saw in public and private performances during Carnival, including Farinelli, Caffarelli, and Faustina Bordoni Hasse. His passion for opera is apparent not only in his frequent depictions of operatic composers and performers but also by the fact that he served as impresario for a private theater. Through his drawings Ghezzi portrayed a musical world in which he himself participated.

The *Mondo novo* (the name Ghezzi gave his collection) is therefore an important documentary source for the history of music. Thanks to Ghezzi's drawings we often are able to have a precise idea of the facial and other physical features of many of the most prominent musical personalities of the time. His 1723 sketch of Vivaldi, for instance, is considered by many scholars to be the most authentic pictorial representation of the famous "*prete rosso*." Ghezzi's sketches are also useful for understanding teaching and various musical practices. For example, his two drawings of *maestri di cappella* (Franzoli and Basili) giving singing lessons offer glimpses into the nature of private vocal instruction in the early 18th century. Numerous drawings are also helpful for their detailed representations of musical instruments and methods of playing the instruments.

Only recently has the significance of the title Ghezzi gave his collection of caricatures finally been realized. According to Claudio Strinati, the name *Mondo novo* came from a popular game of the time that involved a type of "magic lamp" and cut-out figures. Others maintain the title emphasizes the "modern" artistic world in which Ghezzi circulated, as opposed to the "classical." In any event, Ghezzi indeed developed an entirely new form of pictorial representation that captured the musical life of early *settecento* Rome.

Rostirolla's project has yielded a treasure trove of information about eighteenth-century musical and theatrical culture. The most enjoyable, and perhaps most useful, aspect of the book is the rare opportunity it provides for immersing oneself in the distinctive milieu of this relatively obscure niche of operatic history. Ghezzi's nearly four hundred "musical" sketches depict in vivid detail and with captivating precision many of the major figures in the operatic world of the time. The fine points of singing poses, instrumental playing, wigs, hairstyles, and costumes are also revealed. This marvelous collection sheds valuable light on the musical environment of *settecento* Rome and can help opera historians reconstruct the colorful theatrical world of the early eighteenth century.

John Spitzer and Neal Zaslaw, *The Birth of the Orchestra: History of an Institution, 1650–1815* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2004).

Mara Parker

*The Birth of the Orchestra* is an impressive and ambitious piece of scholarship. The authors not only trace the development of the

orchestra from its earliest stages, they also take into account its place within the social and cultural history of the time period, and consider the people who staff it, those who patronize the ensemble, and various physical aspects. This broad-based approach is similar to an ethnomusicological study for it examines musical, sociological, and cultural factors. Thus the orchestra as an institution becomes a means by which to explain the culture in which it exists, as well as the belief systems of those who support it.

In many respects, *The Birth of the Orchestra* is two books in one. In the first part, the authors relate, in narrative form, the story of how the orchestra came into existence, and follow its growth and development up to its establishment as a permanent institution. The authors devote the first eight chapters to the who, what, when, where, how, and why of the orchestra—its birth, meaning of the term, development, regularization, and establishment as an accepted institution. This approach, as argued by Spitzer and Zaslaw, differs from that of others in that it is not based on any of the more standardized approaches: etymology, taxonomy, organology, orchestration, or social history. Instead, it incorporates some of those ideas as needed, in order to meet the larger goal of viewing the orchestra as an institution. Moving from a generalized study of the appearance and use of large instrumental ensembles (intermedii, table music, court operas and masques, French string bands, theater, and church), the authors trace the rise of the orchestra in France, Italy, Germany, and England. While it is born sometime during the second half of the seventeenth century, the growth, development, and establishment of the orchestra as a free-standing and independent entity is a long process which does not come to fruition until the end of the eighteenth century and into the early nineteenth century. In each case, the orchestra is not considered as fully developed until it meets certain requirements: it is a permanent, standing, and often public ensemble; its balance, proportions, and instrumentation have been regularized; it possesses its own repertoire; it has its own internal organization; it develops a unique set of traditions, sounds, and practices; and the boundaries between orchestral and non-orchestral ensembles are established.

While Chapters 3 and 4 provide a fine examination of the importance of Lully and Corelli respectively on the development of certain practices and disciplines, Chapters 5 through 8 offer an excellent overview of the time period covered in the book's title in each of the aforementioned countries. Any of these chapters can be read and used on its own; each presents the reader with a social and cultural history designed to enhance one's understanding of all aspects of music history.

Chapter 9 focuses not only on the existence and establishment of the classical orchestra in its purest sense, but also its demise and the start of the nineteenth-century orchestra. The late-eighteenth and early-nineteenth centuries saw the establishment of an orchestra that was both stable and normative. In particular, the authors focus on three aspects: the instruments (tuning, design, usage, disappearance of the figured bass), the internal organization (four-part string scoring, "basso" part, use of winds in pairs), and the balance and proportions (size, regional differences). "The End of the Classical Orchestra," the final subsection of this chapter, notes changes in scoring, the rise of the conductor as a performer in his/her own right, new venues, and new roles for the institution. In addition, physical improvements in the instruments themselves, the development of the "monster" orchestra for large festival occasions, changes in balance and proportion, and the move from the court

to the public setting all contributed to the decline of the classical orchestra and the rise of the romantic one.

Charting both the rise and fall of the classical orchestra within this single chapter can be problematic because the five chapters that follow, which to this reader comprise “Part 2” of this study, are anticlimactic. These remaining chapters examine those characteristics commonly considered within the province of the established orchestra: orchestration (effects); placement, seating, and acoustics; performance practice; the life of the eighteenth-century orchestral music; and the meaning of the term “orchestra.” As with earlier ones, any of these chapters can be read on its own, for each offers a wealth of information on rather diverse subjects. For example, Chapter 11, which looks at performance practice, examines the development and establishment of uniform standards with regard to bowing and articulation, tuning and intonation, the elimination of improvised ornamentation, rehearsing, and orchestral leadership. In contrast, Chapter 12 offers five case studies that illustrate how an eighteenth-century musician supported himself. Although the authors establish three hypothetical models for how a musician earned a living—the Kapelle, the free market, the civic setting—they acknowledge that in reality one is more likely to find a mixing of these models.

The final chapter, “The Meaning of the Orchestra,” deals with metaphors, both as a means of defining the orchestra, but also, after the institution is an accepted one, as a means of defining other ideas. In the beginning, the orchestra, with its sheer number of players, was considered a novelty. As such, it required explaining, usually in terms of something else—an army, a choir, a mega instrument, a natural phenomenon, or even an organism. As it became more commonplace and familiar, the orchestra served as a source for others to use to explain still newer topics. The authors argue that this web of metaphors that connect the orchestra to nature, society, and culture, also allow that institution to serve as a reflection of cultural, political, and social systems. Although quite interesting, I remain unconvinced that the orchestra is an effective means by which to explain cultural and societal changes. Rather, and as the authors have persuasively argued throughout the text, the birth and development of the orchestra should be viewed as a long and involved process. While many changes may be viewed within the context of cultural and historical events, one runs the risk of ignoring the unique and special features that define the orchestra. Thus an orchestra should be viewed in light of the culture that supports it, but not be used to explain changes in that culture.

*The Birth of the Orchestra* offers something for nearly everyone interested in the music of the period 1650–1815. Whether one focuses on the growth of the orchestra itself, on instrumental development, on musical life in France, or on German court life, there is much to be gained from this worthy text. Moreover, the authors’ reliance on and explanation of primary source material—court records and other documents, letters, iconography, and the music itself—allows for a fresh perspective from which to consider the lengthy gestation of the orchestra. The appendices and numerous charts, tables, and figures alone are worth examination. Not only do they contain a treasure trove of information about the makeup and membership of various orchestras during the period in question, one also is provided with lists of names of musicians active at specific places and times, excellent reproductions of engravings and drawings, instrument distribution within numerous orchestras, and size comparisons.

## Performance Review

Dorothea Link

Antonio Salieri, *La grotta di Trofonio*, conducted by Christophe Rousset at the Opéra de Lausanne, 6–15 March 2005

The fortuitous timing of the production of Salieri’s *La grotta di Trofonio* during my spring break allowed me to travel to Lausanne, Switzerland, to attend three performances of this delightful opera. Rarely heard since the end of the eighteenth century, this operatic gem is a welcome addition to the growing number of operatic revivals from the period. Christophe Rousset and his period-instrument orchestra *Les Talens Lyriques* performed the opera five times between 6 and 15 March 2005 at the Opéra de Lausanne to full houses. Rousset has built up a following there with previous operas that include Cavalli’s *Didone* (2000), Martín y Soler’s *La capricciosa corretta* (2002), Lully’s *Roland* (2003), and Mozart’s *Die Entführung aus dem Serail* (2004).

The singers engaged for this production were without exception perfectly suited to their roles, and acted and sang with conviction. The sorcerer Trofonio was performed by Carlo Lepore, whose powerful delivery evoked the “stentorian lungs” of Francesco Benvenuti, the singer who created the role. Raffaella Milanese stepped into the shoes of Nancy Storace in her portrayal of the thoughtful and serious Ofelia. Marie Arnet performed her twin sister, the lively and spirited Dori, originally sung by Celeste Coltellini. The women undergo a change of personality into their opposites, thanks to Trofonio’s magic. Their lovers, Artemidoro and Plistene, undergo similar changes but at different times in the story, thereby creating the enjoyable confusion that is the point of the libretto. All four roles, consequently, make unusually large demands on the singers, both vocally and dramatically. The honeyed lyricism of Artemidoro’s part, originally written for Vincenzo Calvesi, gives way to an overexuberance of high spirits, both convincingly portrayed by Nikolai Schukoff. Plistene’s bubbly liveliness, in turn, mellows into a smooth cantilena. Mario Cassi mediated between the two vocal styles with the same ease as the versatile Stefano Mandini must have done. Finally, the sisters’ father, Aristone, was portrayed by Olivier Lallouette. With his clear, ringing tones, which show to particular effect in the “Trofonio, Trofonio” calls in the second finale, and his unassuming acting, he most certainly outdid the performance of the original singer Francesco Bussani, whom Count Zinzendorf, an eyewitness at the premiere, berates for his lackluster effort.

Rousset delivered an excellent reading of the score, conducting for the numbers and supplying the continuo for the recitatives on a Zuckerman copy of a Stein fortepiano. Totally at home in this repertoire (see [www.christophe-rousset.com](http://www.christophe-rousset.com); he also made the soundtrack for the film *Farinelli*), he has a good command of rhythm, tempo, and articulation. The orchestra, a tight ensemble, played with vigor and commitment. The score abounds in novel orchestral sonorities, especially from the winds. Particularly lush is the use of two English horns and bassoon as the sole accompaniment for Plistene’s cavatina “Viene o maestro e duce.” The powerful Gluckian ombra scene in which Trofonio makes his first appearance has been discussed in some detail by John A. Rice, *Antonio Salieri and Viennese Opera*, pp. 363–366. (See also Mary Hunter, *The Culture of Opera Buffa in Mozart’s Vienna: A Poetics of Entertainment*, for further discussion of the opera.)

The staging, décor, and costumes might be described as stylized modern or perhaps fifties-ish with an element of fantasy. The director, Marcial Di Fonzo Bo, used the chorus of spirits that attends Trofonio additionally as servants in Aristone's household to supply background antics during the dramatically static sections of the music. Elsewhere, in the scene where the men go in search of the women, wooden skis and canvas mountain gear, probably dug out from some Lausanne attic, added a touch of local color.

For readers who wish they could have seen the production, the good news is that the opera has been recorded on compact disc and will be issued on the Ambrosie label (distributed by Harmonia Mundi) in fall 2005. It joins recordings of Martin's *La capricciosa corretta* (2004), Lully's *Roland* (2004), Lully's *Persée* (2001), and Mozart's *Mitridate, rè di Ponto* (1999). Further information can be found on [www.lestalenslyriques.com](http://www.lestalenslyriques.com).



## Recording Reviews

### First Recordings of Outstanding Concertos

Tony Gable

Joseph Boulogne called *Le Chevalier De Saint-Georges* (c. 1745-1799), Violin Concertos (volume 2) in D op. post. no. 2, G (No. 10), D op. 3 no.1, Qian Zhou (violin), Toronto Camerata, Kevin Mallon. Naxos, 8.557322.

This second Naxos volume features different performers from the first and is free of volume one's intrusive harpsichord. The main attraction is the concerto in D op. post. no. 2, new to the catalogue. (Op. post. no.1 is a set of violin sonatas). Almost certainly Saint-Georges's last orchestral work, the concerto was published shortly after he died in 1799 by Pleyel, a trenchant judge of quality. Allan Badley's note highlights the superb slow movement. Surely Rossini recalled the opening of this stunning adagio for his famous prayer in *Moses in Egitto*. The work also has a strong affinity with Viotti, not possible in the earlier concertos of 1772-1782, two of which also feature here. The allegro's lyrical second subject and double-stopping speak of Viotti, as does the sheer scale – the longest allegro of all the concertos. Viotti listened carefully to Saint-Georges and his colleagues in the Paris of the 1780s. There is a quite different feel to this work compared with the thirteen Saint-Georges concertos previously recorded: more spacious and looser, with the development section occupying nearly a third of the cadenza-free allegro. Jean-Jacques Kantorow recorded op. 3/1 (c1774) on a pioneering LP, reissued on an Arion CD of four concertos (1990). It is also on the 5-CD *Avenir* set (1998) together with 6 symphonies concertantes, a symphony, and eleven other violin concertos, including Naxos No. 10. (In fact, No. 13 might be more accurate, which *Avenir* numbers as op. 8 no. 11.) Together with op. post. no. 2 *Avenir* omitted op. 7/1, which appeared on a 1999 Forlane bicentenary CD. No. 10's largo is familiar from the first Naxos disc as it is also the slow movement of op. 5/2 (c1774). Saint-Georges has fared well on disc, although the op.6 symphonies concertantes, some string quartets of 1777 and 1785 (op.14), and stage works have yet to appear. Here the vital performances do justice to the music.

Ignaz Pleyel (1757-1831), String Concertos, Volume 2: Violin Concerto in D Ben.103/103A, Serenade in D Ben.201A. Vilmos Szabadi (violin), Peter Szabo (cello), Erdödy Chamber Orchestra. Hungaroton, HDC 32241.

At last a recording of Pleyel's sole violin concerto (c1786) and with the inestimable bonus of the second finale (1788). This Hungaroton issue is also a second volume, volume one featuring the cello concertos. How taut and well-argued is the first movement, more controlled and economical than Saint-Georges. The D-minor largo is simply masterly, the violin floating above a pizzicato throb. The disc places the second finale before the original, this latter being one of Pleyel's longest (12 minutes). A good enough piece, but quite eclipsed by the new rondo, half the length, with a wonderfully catchy 6/8 theme vaguely reminiscent of *Lilliburlero*. (Did Pleyel already have an eye on the English market and a London visit?) An absolute toe-tapping winner. Reworked from an even longer piece, the serenade Ben. 201A (1780s) still outstays its welcome, despite some fine things like the newly-composed and irresistible finale. Also known as Symphony no. 19 (Imbault) and as a sinfonia concertante (vl/vc), it appeared as such on an all-Pleyel Discover disc (1994) in a smaller-scale performance by the 8-strong Moscow Concertino, where it is wrongly described as the symphony in A Ben.137. The Hungaroton performances are excellent but the violinist is too closely miked: breathing, even page-turning, are frequently off-putting. Neither these irritations nor some imperfections in the Naxos performances are major drawbacks.

Peter von Winter (1754-1825), Symphonies nos. 2 in F, 3 in B-flat, Clarinet Concerto in E-flat, Aria "Torni al tuo sen la calma" for soprano with obbligato clarinet. Dieter Klöcker (clarinet), Isolde Siebert (soprano), Südwestdeutsches Kammerorchester Pforzheim, Johannes Moesus. Orfeo, C 192041 A.

A varied program, all of it new to the catalogue, from a period (1780s) well before Winter acquired his 'von'. It is good to have an entire disc devoted to Mozart's 'worst enemy' (letter to Leopold, 22.12.1781). Thomas Gebhard's persuasive note suggests 1780 for the clarinet concerto possibly written for Tausch. We have Gebhard to thank for the recording of this fine work based on a manuscript copy dated 1793. As with the recordings above, there is a beautiful slow movement, here in the major, over a pizzicato accompaniment. If Saint-Georges prefigures serious Rossini, Winter's theme in the wayward finale evokes Donizetti in comic vein. This finale is a set of variations, including a delightful polonaise, masquerading as a rondo and sounding later than 1780. Gebhard suggests the aria with clarinet (1788, rediscovered by Klöcker) may have been intended for an opera that came to nothing. The inventive symphonies (c1780) both have affinities thematically with Rosetti in the ubiquitous rising motifs. The restless adagio of the F major is particularly fine, one section briefly foreshadowing the larghetto of Beethoven's second symphony. Numbering follows the first edition (1795) rather than that of Garland where they are nos. 3 and 4. Johannes Moesus's riveting performances draw a splendid response from the orchestra. True to form, Moesus favors rasping horns. He does wonders with the ostinato accompaniment in the concerto's allegro. Klöcker is predictably excellent, even if the first-movement cadenza seemed over-long. These CDs are available from: [service@jpc.de](mailto:service@jpc.de).

## Fortieth Annual Meeting of the Royal Music Association

*Jen-yen Chen*

The fortieth annual meeting of the Royal Music Association took place from 12 to 14 November 2004 in Birmingham, England and featured a generous selection of papers on eighteenth-century topics. Unfortunately, attendance at the meeting was on the low side (certainly in comparison to RMA 2003 in Cardiff, Wales), probably because of the simultaneous scheduling with the AMS conference in Seattle, as a number of participants informally remarked to me during the course of the weekend. Nevertheless, those present enjoyed a group of engaging papers whose subject matter ranged from Pérotin to Wolfgang Rihm.

In this report I shall cover only presentations on eighteenth-century music, which comprised a total of twelve of the conference's thirty-five papers as well as a magisterial keynote lecture on J.S. Bach's Passions by John Butt, the 2004 Dent Medalist. The first day of the meeting featured three sessions of three papers each, all grouped under the rubric "Austro-German Traditions." Music of the nineteenth and twentieth centuries dominated this opening day, as only one of the nine papers, delivered by yours truly, dealt with the eighteenth century. In my presentation I discussed Jürgen Habermas's conception of the emergent bourgeois public of the eighteenth century and related this conception to Austrian musical life of the period. I argued that incongruities between theoretical model and case study underscore the stubborn persistence of older forms of musical patronage that represents a peculiar but essential characteristic of the Austrian milieu.

The second day of the conference included two sessions exclusively on eighteenth-century topics. The first of these, entitled "Eighteenth-Century Song," began with a paper by Tim Crawford on chorale settings for lute in manuscripts in the hand of Louise Gottsched, wife of Johann Christoph Gottsched and lute enthusiast. Crawford suggested that the sketched notation of "Ich bin ja, Herr, in deiner Macht" in a setting of this melody may indicate a devotional song with lute accompaniment. Devotional song also formed the subject of the next paper by Stephen Rose on Protestant death-music intended for domestic, intimate contexts. According to Rose, this music, strikingly different from better-known funerary genres such as the Requiem, illustrates a distinctive brand of musical expression infused with Pietist subjectivity and embodying aspects of oral culture. The third and final paper of the session, by Kevin Stannard, was devoted to the work of an eighteenth-century songwriter of local interest, John Pixell.

The day's other eighteenth-century session offered papers on the music of Handel. Suzana Ograjensek discussed the two versions of the opera *Riccardo primo* and presented evidence for a different interpretation of the work's delayed premier and subsequent rewriting. She argued that Handel's revisions stemmed for the most part not from a feud between the sopranos Cuzzoni and Bordoni and from the death of King George I, as the usual view has it, but more prosaically from the need to eliminate one of the opera's roles (Corrado) following a cast reduction. David Hunter gave a report on his ongoing ten-year research project on Handel's English audiences, involving the examination of materials in 84 libraries, archives, and institutions in Britain, Ireland, and the U.S. (of which he has so far visited 32). The session concluded with a paper by Berta Joncus on Handel's links with Drury Lane and

in particular with the career of the soprano Catherine Clive, who was the theater's best-known star. In exploring these links, Joncus highlighted the significance of the tradition of ballad opera for an understanding of Handel's work, even proposing an influence of Mrs. Clive and her reputation upon the design and character of the oratorio *Samson*.

Four further papers on eighteenth-century music were delivered during this second day. I was not able to attend one of them, a presentation by Ju-Lee Hong on Pablo Casals's interpretations of Bach (part of a session on aspects of performance), because this took place at the same time as Suzana Ograjensek's paper. Guy Dammann offered a paper on Rousseau's music theory in one of two sessions on music and ideas in France, in which he considered and questioned the viability of this theory as a credible philosophy of music. A high point of the conference, in my view, was the presentation by Michael Fend, also in the same session, on the notion of energy as applied to late eighteenth-century Parisian opera. Drawing upon discussions of force in treatises on rhetoric and upon conceptions of music as the most powerful of the arts (e.g. Diderot), Fend illuminated an eighteenth-century preoccupation with energy as a supra-moral challenge to political and theological/supernatural constraints which assumed tangible form in operatic moments such as Orfeo's cry "Euridice!" from Gluck's *Orfeo ed Euridice*. An additional paper on Rousseau by Jacqueline Waeber formed part of the second session on French music and ideas and discussed both the evolution of the concept of unity of melody and the problematic reception of this concept during Rousseau's lifetime as well as during the twentieth century.

As with the first day of the conference, the last day featured one paper on an eighteenth-century topic, given by Thomas Irvine on aspects of notation Mozart's String Quartet in A major, K. 464. This paper, part of a session on notation that drew upon the work of John Butt as its point of departure, examined the relationships of earlier sources of the quartet to the 1785 publication of the work. Comparing in particular differences in performative indications, it considered contemporary attitudes towards performance as active communication rather than mere transmission and suggested that negative responses to the six Haydn quartets had to do with Mozart's "over-determined" notational nuances.

The aforementioned keynote address by Professor Butt amply demonstrated the brilliance that one routinely expects from this preeminent scholar. Broadly comparing the St. John Passion and St. Matthew Passion, Butt articulated a process of developing autonomy and subjecthood that points to the emerging modernity of the early eighteenth century. Throughout his one-hour lecture, he insightfully clarified the wide gulf between two works written only three years apart: focus on Scripture vs. focus on poetic texts, Christ as sacrifice vs. Christ as ideal human, acclamatory vs. searching opening choruses. Moving finally to a discussion of musical details, Butt showed how a fundamental difference in compositional technique highlights the modern, humanistic orientation of the later work: in the solo numbers of the St. Matthew Passion, the vocal music remains largely independent of the instrumental music, thereby providing a compelling aural representation of human subjectivity.

The variety and depth of the papers on eighteenth-century music at this meeting of the Royal Music Association offer an unmistakable sign of the vitality of scholarship in this area on *both* sides of the Atlantic.

composer—a proponent of Socialist Realism *avant la lettre*. And not surprisingly, many of the intellectual trends of the late twentieth century have been applied to Mozart biography: he has of course been the subject of social history, the history of ideas and histories of musical style. He has also been put on the psychoanalytical couch, acquired status as a New Age guru, and made into a pink-haired punk. He has been constructed, deconstructed and reconstructed.

Because of the complexity of Mozart’s person, music and times, and given the vast amount of extant documentation about all these aspects, almost any approach to writing about him can be supported by at least some evidence, and often by a great deal of it. The difficult task that Stanley seemed to have in mind was to consider all of these approaches but allow none to hijack the narrative. Thus the ‘general’ picture.

On the personal side Stanley was, I suspect, thinking about the way his career had gone. Despite his prolific contributions as a music critic, broadcaster, reviewer, essayist, author and editor (detailed in *Words About Mozart*, a 2005 festschrift in his honor), and especially in his crowning achievement of creating nearly from scratch *The New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians*, arguably the finest music encyclopedia ever conceived, Stanley longed to have the leisure to make a different type of original contribution to scholarship. He loved Mozart’s music and knew it well, having written about it on many occasions. He himself wrote the Mozart article for *The New Grove*, which then enjoyed success as a separate publication. But even a relatively long encyclopedia article must be compact and factual, lacking adequate space to explore complex or contentious issues, to limn the background, to take time to dwell on the many fascinating elements that would comprise a fully nuanced telling. Stanley wanted to have a go at our culture’s portrayal of Mozart, painting it in his own way on a large canvas.

Stanley was one of the hardest working people I ever met. He often had several projects under way at once, pursuing them with fierce determination and lucid organization. It was those qualities, along with an extraordinary memory for details (decades after a year I had spent in London, he still could summon up my phone number there, which I myself had long forgotten), that enabled him to create *The New Grove*, which involved coordinating unimaginable amounts of information, dealing with numerous contributors from every continent—some of them temperamental, others tardy in meeting their deadlines—and then choosing, training and supervising a staff to high levels of competence. His journalistic and broadcast assignments had given him the opportunity to hone his prose style, which was elegant and clear without being patronizing. His work on *The New Grove* had turned him into a generalist who could deal with arcane details without losing track of larger contexts. These were the skills he brought to his desire to write a big book about Mozart.

I suspect Stanley probably thought about this book as he commuted to and from work or lay awake at night, but his seemingly endless rounds of other assignments meant that he had trouble finding uninterrupted time for a project of such scope. A research fellowship at Sidney Sussex College of the University of Cambridge, gave him some weeks of calm, during which he was able to outline the book and write drafts of some chapters. But then a horrific automobile accident in the Ukrainian–Russian outback, while researching *Calling on the Composer* (a book on composers’ homes

written with his wife, Julie Ann) proved to be a major setback. Fortunately he was flown to London by a rescue service, miraculously brought back from death’s door and reassembled by skillful surgeons. Soon he was back to other work, and the big book had to be put aside.

Finally, Stanley left his beloved London and retreated to the bucolic splendor of the Manor House at Cossington. There he and Julie founded a concert series, tended their garden, and entertained visiting family, friends and colleagues; and he began to finish what he had begun at Cambridge. But disaster struck again, this time in the form of a wasting illness that slowly sapped Stanley’s strength. With the tenacity that had characterized all his endeavors, he succeeded in finishing the first half of his Mozart biography, working at it until almost his last day.

Reading Stanley’s account of the early years of Mozart’s life, I experience many emotions. Sorrow at having lost a valued friend and colleague. Admiration for the book and for the doggedness that enabled him to finish it even as his life ebbed away. Pleasure at the idea that he was able to finish it. Enjoyment of an old story well told with many a new twist. Regret at never being able to read his take on the final ten years of Mozart’s life.

Stanley’s book has many virtues, resulting in part from his command of the vast Mozart literature, of which he somehow kept abreast until the end. This factual basis undergirds his companionable prose style, an obvious passion for the task at hand, his ability to deal with controversial issues in an even-handed manner, and perhaps most strikingly, his gift for conveying a sense of time and place. Stanley had visited most of the cities, villages, courts and monasteries that the widely traveled Mozart had frequented, walking in and around the surviving houses, theaters and palaces where Mozart had walked. His words have the ability almost to make you feel the cobblestones underfoot, smell the inns and horses, and hear the music. Stanley’s Mozart is not an idealized archetype but a flesh-and-blood—if exceptionally gifted—human being trying to live his life. It is perhaps no longer possible to write a single Mozart for our fractious times, but Stanley Sadie has come perhaps as close as anyone could.



*“Conferences” continued from page 3*

topics such as “Viennese Choral Traditions,” “Sources and Authenticity,” “*La Betulia liberata*,” and “Reconsidering the Requiem.” For more information contact Bruce Brown at [brucebro@usc.edu](mailto:brucebro@usc.edu) or Dan Melamed at [dmelamed@indiana.edu](mailto:dmelamed@indiana.edu).

The British Society for Eighteenth-Century Studies will hold its 35th Annual Conference, 4–6 January 2006, at St. Hugh’s College, Oxford. For more information see: [www.bsecs.org.uk](http://www.bsecs.org.uk).

On November 4–6, 2005, The Indiana University School of Music in Bloomington will host a special conference on The Eighteenth-Century Symphony dedicated to the memory of the late A. Peter Brown. Professor Brown’s last scholarly project, the five-volume series entitled *The Symphonic Repertoire*, remained incomplete at his death. This conference will feature presentations by eighteen of the scholars collaborating on the writing of the first volume of that series. There will be no charge for attending the conference, but if you are interested please contact Mary Sue Morrow ([marysue Morrow@uc.edu](mailto:marysue Morrow@uc.edu); 513-556-4031) for further information.